

Town of Milton
Historic Preservation Committee Meeting
Milton Library, 121 Union Street
Tuesday, December 14, 2010
7:00 p.m.

1. Dennis Hughes: Called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. Roll call of members:

Michael Ostinato	Present
Amy Kratz	Present
Dennis Hughes	Present
Gwen Foehner	Present
Kevin Kelly	Present
Sally Harkins	Present (Arrived at 7:04 p.m.)

Dennis Hughes: We have five members present.

3. Correction and Approval of the Agenda

Dennis Hughes: Robin is there anything that you know of, or does anybody else, have any corrections or approvals? If not, I'll entertain a motion.

Michael Ostinato: I would like to make a motion that we approve the agenda.

Kevin Kelly: Second.

Dennis Hughes: All in favor, aye. Opposed. Motion carried.

4. Approval of the Minutes

Dennis Hughes: Has everybody seen the draft of the minutes? Does anybody have any questions or corrections to the minutes? If not, we'll entertain a motion to accept the minutes of November 9th.

Kevin Kelly: So moved, Mr. Chairman.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, do I hear a second?

Gwen Foehner: Second.

Dennis Hughes: Motion has been made and seconded. Any questions on the motion? If not, all in favor, aye. Opposed. Motion carried unanimously.

5. Business

- a. Discussion and possible vote on the application from Bernard and Nancy Murphy for exterior renovations to the house located at 202 Federal Street, further identified by Sussex County Tax Map and Parcel Number: 2-35-20.07-65.00

Dennis Hughes: What we'll do is open it up to Mr. Murphy and you can start it off.

Bernard Murphy: I currently live in Alexandria, VA and we own 202 Federal Street and I appreciate you all coming out on this cold evening. I'm not sure what the protocol for the meeting is.

Dennis Hughes: I want to make a correction to the Roll Call. Sally Harkins is now with us. Everybody has a copy of the application to the Historic Preservation review and it started off, I believe there were like seven different, or actually six different parts of it. So in the past, we have voted on them separately. So we'll go over each one and then we'll vote on them individually or altogether. When we get to the end, we'll make that decision. Remove and remodel existing second story on rear of the house. Do you want to cover that?

Bernard Murphy: Sure. Basically the back of the house has an addition on the second floor; it's sort of a dormer, that when we bought the house for years ago, we had a structural engineer; and I can provide you with the documentation; take a look at the house and one of the things that he pointed out was that the roof in the back actually has a dip in it. It was not constructed properly. Yes, exactly what you are pointing to there.

Dennis Hughes: Everybody, it's on the existing additions, on page two on the bottom.

Bernard Murphy: Right, the back section; and he said that in time I would have to replace the roof. So last year when we had the snow, I came down several times because actually I was afraid that it might cave in. It didn't, it seems to be solid, but rather than replace it the way that it is, what I want to do is to make the changes as the plans indicate; which would actually be consistent with all the houses; when you face the house, to the left; all the houses on that street actually the second floor goes straight up, the way we've designed the plans and that's what MR Design had planned it that way so it wouldn't really change the configuration of the rest of the houses there. I'm not sure why they put the small dormer the way they did on that house in the first place; it seemed like they should have gone all the way out to the edge, like all the other houses were. So that's the first part of what we would be doing, is the back of the house.

Dennis Hughes: That's actually the picture of that side view from the right elevation. Does everybody see that?

Amy Kratz: So you're going to demolish the whole length of the storage, or just the second story and raise it up.

Bernard Murphy: Just the second; take the roof off and raise it up.

Kevin Kelly: Mr. Murphy which of these photographs is it that we're looking at.

Bernard Murphy: It's actually in a couple of them.

Kevin Kelly: Right.

Bernard Murphy: It's this section right here and that's the same section; that's the same section.

Kevin Kelly: Thank you.

Amy Kratz: Is it this one Mr. Murphy?

Bernard Murphy: Correct, yes, yes, yeah.

Dennis Hughes: The roof will be the same materials as the existing roof?

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Kevin Kelly: Do you know when that dormer, that addition was put on the house?

Bernard Murphy: I have no idea.

Kevin Kelly: Was it original to the 1860 house? Do you know?

Bernard Murphy: I can't imagine that it was. The house has been remodeled many times.

Dennis Hughes: If I can remember correctly, the brick part was added on the front and I believe that was added at the same time.

Bernard Murphy: Is that right? Okay.

Amy Kratz: It doesn't look like it belongs to the house, but I don't know.

Bernard Murphy: My wife is trying to get some pictures from a friend she went to college with who actually lived in the house and at one time, she said she has pictures and there was a front porch that literally went all the way across the front of that house; and that when they put the brick front on, of course, then they put the smaller porch on there, which is an item later on. I think that was all done about the same time.

Kevin Kelly: This was the Atkins house, Capt. Atkins house, originally? Are you aware?

Bernard Murphy: It's next to the Atkins house.

Kevin Kelly: Next to it. I couldn't quite figure it out, because 202 and 204 seem to change numbers at some point, the two house numbers.

Bernard Murphy: It's across the street from the Victorian house that's being redone.

Kevin Kelly: I know where the house is, I just, when I was searching the records it was; it seemed like, I don't know why.

Dennis Hughes: Does anybody else have any questions on that front?

Kevin Kelly: And Mr. Murphy the appearance of the house would be consistent with neighboring houses in terms of the same kinds of modifications and changes that have been made to them?

Bernard Murphy: Yes, the house that you're referring to, the Adkins House, that's exactly what it... It just goes straight up, so the second floor...

Kevin Kelly: It runs to the height of the roof line, perpendicular to the base of the house.

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Gwen Foehner: So this drawing up here is what it would look like?

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Gwen Foehner: This one right here.

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Kevin Kelly: The right elevation and back elevation?

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Amy Kratz: So you're not going to butt out the sides of the house; you're going to keep it straight up with the roofing; so it needs the elevation of the... Okay. I get it.

Bernard Murphy: Right. When you look at some of the photographs now, what you see are a variety of rooflines there. And surprisingly on the inside the height of that room is probably 7'. They went to all that trouble, but the ceiling is only about 7' high.

Amy Kratz: It almost looks like they put an Arts and Crafts style house in the back of a colonial farmhouse. That's what it looks like anyway.

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, does anybody else have any questions about that. Let's go on to Item 2, remove and replace exterior siding. Is that all over the house?

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Dennis Hughes: How about the brick work; will it come off?

Bernard Murphy: Only the brick work on the front of the house. The brick work on the side of the house, we would maintain that. It's the brick work on the front of the house, that's been painted over.

Dennis Hughes: Is that this?

Bernard Murphy: No, that's the side, that's the side of the house.

Dennis Hughes: You're going to keep that?

Bernard Murphy: Yes. It's painted the same color as the aluminum; it's probably the first picture. It actually is a problem because the brick sits out from the siding and the rain gets behind that and it wasn't done correctly in the first place; nor is it in keeping with the rest of the houses on the street.

Dennis Hughes: What type of siding are you going to put back?

Bernard Murphy: It's hardi-plank.

Dennis Hughes: That's like cement board. It's like what they put on the Historic Society.

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Dennis Hughes: Does anybody else have any questions? We'll move on to the next one. Remove and relocate existing windows.

Amy Kratz: Which windows would that be?

Bernard Murphy: The windows on that addition on the second floor.

Dennis Hughes: These here?

Bernard Murphy: Yes, on the second floor, yes, right.

Dennis Hughes: Right here?

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Dennis Hughes: So you're going to put like an A-frame roof; it will go up and then this from here on will go up and you'll put the roof up; but it will probably go up to the same height as that?

Bernard Murphy: Correct.

P. D. Camenisch: I think it's drawn that way.

Bernard Murphy: If you look at the drawings you'll see.

P. D. Camenisch: Matt drew it that way on the drawings.

Bernard Murphy: Right.

P. D. Camenisch: It should be the back elevation, the side elevation.

Dennis Hughes: Okay back elevation.

Bernard Murphy: Correct, yes those are the windows.

Kevin Kelly: Is it the left or the right elevation. Which is it, left or right?

Dennis Hughes: Right elevation shows there actually are going to be four windows, 2 small and 2 larger size.

Bernard Murphy: And then there's a left elevation on the other side, right under your hand.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, yes, okay, yes. That's going to be like a little porch.

Bernard Murphy: Yes, right.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, so everybody understands what he's talking about there? So the only windows you're going to move are on the new roof.

Bernard Murphy: Correct.

Dennis Hughes: Okay. Does anybody else have any questions on this section?

Amy Kratz: There's something on this application that I think I'm going to mention it to get it on the record. This part, right here, on this – you're taking that all off, am I correct?

Bernard Murphy: Exactly, it will extend all the way to the back.

Amy Kratz: But not this part? You're keeping the bottom of that part; so you're taking all the littler... It looks like a telescope at the top of this house. Do you know what I mean? It goes down and then it goes down again. So you're going to just take all this stuff off.

Bernard Murphy: That's correct.

Amy Kratz: I just wanted to make sure that's there for the record. That's all. I have no more questions.

Dennis Hughes: Raise the rear roof level to the front. Well that's actually in with the move on the rear of the house. Enlarge the front porch and that's right here, the front elevation.

Bernard Murphy: Yes, well what we want to do there is just make the porch a little bit wider, so it's proportional to the front of the house. If you've ever looked at that porch, it's way too small and it just...

Kevin Kelly: How many, I know I can look at the drawing, but how many feet; what's the difference between the existing front porch width, as you face the house, and the proposed change; roughly?

Bernard Murphy: It's probably like... Right now the pad is 6 or 8 feet wide.

P. D. Camenisch: Right – I think we're going out 2 feet on each side.

Bernard Murphy: Yes, two feet on each side; so it's probably roughly 8 to 10 feet wide total.

Kevin Kelly: That's a good memory, 10 feet.

Bernard Murphy: The blue house next door has a porch about that size.

Kevin Kelly: Similar.

Bernard Murphy: Yes, that house, so if you look at that porch it's about the width of that porch.

Dennis Hughes: And the one on the other side.

Bernard Murphy: Yes, the one on the other side, exactly.

Kevin Kelly: But the porch you're proposing to construct will not be a two story porch, will it?

Bernard Murphy: No.

Kevin Kelly: It will be the same story as it has been on that house?

Bernard Murphy: That's right, yes.

Gwen Foehner: It will not be imposed?

Bernard Murphy: No, it will not.

Kevin Kelly: Will you be able to use the columns that are in the existing porch in terms of structure; or are they...

Bernard Murphy: We're probably going to use a similar style, but not those; probably a little bit wider; a bigger column, but that same style of porch column.

Kevin Kelly: With a similar pediment?

Bernard Murphy: Yes. I think there's a picture of those in there.

Kevin Kelly: Yes there is in here.

Bernard Murphy: Right. I think with the porch a little bit wider, the columns need to be a little more substantial.

Sally Harkins: Is this the same front door?

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Sally Harkins: You're not changing it?

Bernard Murphy: No.

Dennis Hughes: It doesn't show, but I presume you'll have the same type of lighting.

Bernard Murphy: Same type?

Dennis Hughes: Lighting?

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, anybody else have anything on that? We'll move to the next which is to repair the side porch; and that would be this one here?

Bernard Murphy: Correct.

Kevin Kelly: Mr. Camenisch could you hold that picture up again please, so we can see which one it is you are referring to? Thank you.

Dennis Hughes: It's going to go down; is it going to go down the whole side of the house?

Bernard Murphy: No the shape of the porch will stay the same; it's just got rot on the side of it that needs to be repaired and replaced.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, but it's going to be over both sets of doors?

Bernard Murphy: No, there is one door. The porch will stay there, the landing is still there; it will all stay the same.

P. D. Camenisch: I think you might be looking at the back elevation; it's on that right side elevation, right there.

Dennis Hughes: Yes, I am looking at the back elevation. I'm sorry.

Kevin Kelly: It's also on the second page, I think preliminary first floor plan you can see that; you can see the footprint.

Dennis Hughes: Will you use the same type colors for the sides and the front?

P. D. Camenisch: Yeah, it will all match.

Bernard Murphy: Right.

Dennis Hughes: Now that one doesn't have any of the squirrely stuff; are you going to put any on that?

Bernard Murphy: I don't think so.

Amy Kratz: Are these the moldings that you're putting on the front porch?

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Amy Kratz: I'm sorry that we're going back and forth; it's just that the Town needs to know this.

Dennis Hughes: I think there's a list of materials.

Amy Kratz: This is all very good.

Dennis Hughes: And he's got the one for the front porch; and the rear of the house, the overhang brackets; and this is a copy of the proposal for the front porch.

Bernard Murphy: Yes.

Gwen Foehner: Can I just ask for a clarification? It says here, under Porches: "When existing structures with traditional porches are renovated, owner shall preserve both the porch and its architectural detailing." So here we go again.

Amy Kratz: It's not the original porch.

P. D. Camenisch: This thing has been renovated like three times. This porch is probably the third porch put in there, from my understanding. Mr. Thomas, the former owner that owned the house several years ago, that loved brick; redid it when he put the brick on the front. He actually tore the porch off and replaced it.

Amy Kratz: It if were the original porch to the house, like this house is like a colonial house; if it were the original porch to the house, because it's like a colonial house, and as Bernie said earlier, the porch originally went all the way across the front. So if he wants to take it off, he's certainly welcome to ask for it. I don't necessarily think that our code would go against it; considering he's making the porch similar to the other porches in the area.

Gwen Foehner: I don't have any argument with it; I think we always need to refer back to what it says.

Amy Kratz: Great idea, you're absolutely correct.

Dennis Hughes: How do we want to handle these; as a total package or, I know in the past we decided to do different ones.

Kevin Kelly: If you want to entertain a motion. But if you don't mind Mr. Chairman, I have one question for clarification.

Dennis Hughes: Okay, go ahead.

Kevin Kelly: Mr. Murphy, if we can go back to the remove and relocate existing windows; for clarification, those are the windows at the rear of the house on the side that are part of raising that roof and raising the height of that part of the structure; and not other windows. So the windows at the ground level, on the main level, they will not be changed;

these are the windows that are above and they need to be changed as a consequence of raising that roof.

Bernard Murphy: Exactly.

Kevin Kelly: Thank you, Sir.

Bernard Murphy: Okay.

Robin Davis: If the board feels comfortable with making one motion, but if you do make the motion, please state in there those items that you discussed so everybody is aware of what we've got. Instead of just saying we approve or disapprove the Application.

Kevin Kelly: Maybe we should do it item by item, then, do you think?

Dennis Hughes: And then that way there is a clear record.

Kevin Kelly: That each item was considered and voted on and there's a record of the vote.

Dennis Hughes: Okay and we'll note that actually the first and third items can be considered as one; because when you raise the existing second story, that the windows would be part of it. We'll make that all in one. We'll start with the first one; remove and remodel existing second story on rear of the house and remove and relocate existing windows. Can I hear a motion?

Amy Kratz: I make a motion that we approve remove and remodel existing second story on rear of the house and remove and relocate existing windows.

Sally Harkins: Second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion made and seconded. Are there any questions on that motion? If not, we'll have a roll call vote:

Michael Ostinato	Approve
Amy Kratz	Approve
Dennis Hughes	Approve
Gwen Foehner	Approve
Kevin Kelly	Approve
Sally Harkins	Approve

Dennis Hughes: So we'll move onto number two; remove and replace exterior siding.

Sally Harkins: I make a motion that we approve removal and replacement of exterior siding.

Kevin Kelly and Gwen Foehner: Second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion made and seconded. Are there any questions on that motion? If not, we'll have a roll call vote:

Michael Ostinato	Approve
Amy Kratz	Approve
Dennis Hughes	Approve
Gwen Foehner	Approve
Kevin Kelly	Approve

Sally Harkins

Approve

Dennis Hughes: So we'll move onto number three; raise the rear roof level to the front roof.

Amy Kratz: I make a motion that we approve raising the rear roof level to the front roof.

Kevin Kelly and Sally Harkins: Second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion made to raise the rear roof level to the front roof. Are there any questions on that motion? If not, we'll have a roll call vote:

Michael Ostinato

Approve

Amy Kratz

Approve

Dennis Hughes

Approve

Gwen Foehner

Approve

Kevin Kelly

Approve

Sally Harkins

Approve

Dennis Hughes: The next one is to enlarge the front porch. I'll entertain a motion.

Michael Ostinato: I make a motion that we approve the enlargement of the front porch.

Kevin Kelly: Second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion made and seconded. Are there any questions on that motion? If not, we'll have a roll call vote:

Michael Ostinato

Approve

Amy Kratz

Approve

Dennis Hughes

Approve

Gwen Foehner

Approve

Kevin Kelly

Approve

Sally Harkins

Approve

Dennis Hughes: Okay and the last item is repair side porch. I'll entertain a motion.

Sally Harkins: I make a motion that we approve the repair of the side porch.

Amy Kratz: Second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion made and seconded. Are there any questions on that motion? If not, we'll have a roll call vote:

Michael Ostinato

Approve

Amy Kratz

Approve

Dennis Hughes

Approve

Gwen Foehner

Approve

Kevin Kelly

Approve

Sally Harkins

Approve

Dennis Hughes: Okay so that's approved, so it looks like Mr. Murphy, you are good to go.

Bernard Murphy: Thank you very much.

Kevin Kelly: Thank you, Sir.

Amy Kratz: Thank you.

- b. Robin Davis: Mr. Chairman, I left that on there from the last meeting, what we did was discuss, at the previous meeting there were some concerns about "shalls" and some wording in there. What was decided by the Commission is that we would kind of get some questions together; if there are some issues in the ordinance that you have questions about, and maybe in the January meeting have the attorney come and that way we can all have a little group and do it then. I just left it on there just to let Gwen and Amy know what that was.

6. Adjournment

Kevin Kelly: Mr. Chairman, given that clarification, I move that we adjourn.

Michael Ostinato: Second.

Amy Kratz: Can I add one more thing? I think it's a very good idea that we discuss all those things, because we always seem to have difficulty figuring out how to interpret this Code. But it is possible that we could also have somebody who is apt at Preservation, give us some kind of idea what a Victorian house would look like; a colonial house would look like; the kinds of things that are normally on them; the kinds of things that... Actually, feasibly the Historic Society has already done a big presentation of all the houses that they would like to put on; that they are planning or wanting to put on the Preservation of the Historic Society, in the District. They have them all labeled, like gothic, Victorian, so everyone would know. This is kind of typically what a Victorian house looks like; and the features of a Victorian house is that they have these turrets, and they have similar... They have features on them that are unique to that particular kind of house. Colonial houses are usually symmetrical; they're very box like, you know things like that. Those are the things I think that might help this Committee. I don't know. It helps me when I'm thinking of these houses; I don't know if it would help anyone else.

Kevin Kelly: Amy, at the Historical Society actually, we've just completed grant work that was won last year and it has to do with that as part of the theme. Why that matters, is that one of the people who was brought in because of that grant, is a woman who actually heads Historic Preservation for the State of Delaware and she would be absolutely agreeable to coming and meeting with us and I'm sure I can speak for her, that she would be happy to do that and explain the characteristics of different types of houses; styles of houses; periods of houses and so on. I'm sure she would love to do that.

Amy Kratz: And why they're that way; and why you wouldn't move a door from the middle of a porch. That's just an example.

Kevin Kelly: We also have that expertise in the Historical Society now; there are people who could give us that information.

Dennis Hughes: After the last meeting, one day, I was out to Route 5 Grill having a sandwich and there was a guy in there who was actually an architect; and we were sitting there talking and I said, can you explain something to me? We talk about architectural details and stuff; and I said if somebody wanted to move something; and he said if you don't mess up the symmetry, which he said is actually that's moving of stuff; but it says no word of that in this code at all.

Amy Kratz: No it doesn't and that's actually what this code lacks.

Dennis Hughes: And this is somebody that could say, sometime down the line, that look this is what architectural details says; and by me doing that, I'm not destroying the architectural details of that house.

Kevin Kelly: But that is inconsistent with Historic Preservation, when you do that. That is one of the things that you really cannot do in Historic Preservation is to disassemble, reassemble or move and reshape; even if you reconstruct everything exactly as it was.

Amy Kratz: That's exactly what I'm always trying to get at, although I'm not an architect.

Kevin Kelly: That's actually part of it.

Dennis Hughes: Well I know that...

Kevin Kelly: But again, this is something that really we should... This is January.

Amy Kratz: I just brought it up because I know that it helps me in making my decisions; because I know architecture; I've studied it; I enjoy it; so I look at it; and I studied it. I'm not an architect.

Robin Davis: Well that's when the Commission asked to put that on the agenda last meeting, that's why I left it on there so that way everybody can get... If you have any questions of anything in the ordinance that you would like to see or questions; do we have a right to do this; do we have a right to do that? That's when we said okay let's get it all together for the attorney so we're not doing 2 or 3 different meetings with the attorney; that way we can kind of group them all together and get him here at one time.

Amy Kratz: We understand.

Gwen Foehner: Are we off the record? Are we adjourned?

Kevin Kelly: No we have not adjourned. We have a motion and a second.

Dennis Hughes: We have a motion and a second to adjourn. All in favor. Aye. Opposed. Motion carried.